Navigating law to share...

Environmental Health Data

Denise Chrysler, JD, Director, Network for Public Health Law – Mid-States Region

Colleen Healy Boufides, JD, Deputy Director, Network for Public Health Law - Mid-States Region

Sangeeta Ghosh, JD, LL.M., Assistant Corporate Counsel, Kent County
Agenda

Introduction: Key Concepts + Goals

Overview of Legal & Policy Challenges

Case Study: Kent County Lead Poisoning Prevention Project
Introduction: Key Concepts + Goals
Law can protect the public

- Air quality
- Water quality
- Sanitation
- Injury prevention

- Safe food
- Workplace safety
- Environmental controls to prevent disease
- Mandatory vaccination
Health impact of interventions

Factors that Affect Health

- Smallest Impact
  - Counseling & Education
  - Clinical Interventions
  - Long-lasting Protective Interventions
  - Changing the Context to make individuals’ default decisions healthy
  - Socioeconomic Factors

- Largest Impact
  - Examples
    - Eat healthy, be physically active
    - Rx for high blood pressure, high cholesterol, diabetes
    - Immunizations, brief intervention, cessation treatment, colonoscopy
    - Fluoridation, 0g trans fat, iodization, smoke-free laws, tobacco tax
    - Poverty, education, housing, inequality

A Framework for Public Health Action, Thomas R. Frieden, AJPH, April 2010

Data Summit 10 03 2019
What is environmental health?

» The branch of public health concerned with monitoring or mitigating those factors in the environment that affect human health and disease.

» Factors may directly affect health or disrupt the ecological balances essential to long-term human health and environmental quality.

» Factors may be natural or man-made.
Three Types of Public Health Tracking for Adverse Environmental Threats

Agent is a hazard

Agent is present in the environment

Route of exposure exists

Host is exposed to agent

Agent reaches target tissue

Agent produces adverse effect

Adverse effect becomes clinically apparent

Hazard Tracking

Exposure Tracking

Health Outcome Tracking

Three Types of Public Health Tracking for Adverse Environmental Threats: Example

- **Hazard**: Lead Paint in Home
- **Exposure**: Elevated Blood Lead Level
- **Health Outcome**: Impaired Cognitive Functioning
What is environmental justice?

» Fair treatment and meaningful involvement of all people regardless of race, color, national origin, or income, with respect to the development, implementation, and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations, and policies.  

Source: EPA

» Environmental justice & health in all policies (remedying the past + going forward)
The conclusion

“The Flint water crisis is a story of government failure, intransigence, unpreparedness, delay, inaction, and environmental injustice.”

Flint Water Advisory Task Force Final Report (March 2016)
3 CRISES

FINANCIAL
- Loss of manufacturing
- People left
- Tax base declined
- Revenue sharing cut
- Infrastructure crumbling

WATER
- Water contaminated with lead
- System compromised
- Community instructed to drink bottled (unfluoridated) & filtered water

PUBLIC HEALTH
- Thousands of children, adults, and pets exposed to lead in the water
- Unknown short and long term consequences

Let’s move upstream
Public Health 3.0 recognizes that we need to focus on the social determinants of health in order to create lasting improvements for the health of everyone in America.

Public health + community organizations create conditions so that everyone has the opportunity to be healthy.
Public Health 3.0 – Data are key

» Requires access to timely, reliable, granular data (i.e. sub-county) and actionable data

» Depends on data from many and diverse sources – including sources and types of data relevant to social determinants

» Should have data that are accessible to communities throughout the country that are shared, linked, and synthesized while protecting data security and individual privacy

» Needs clear metrics to assess impact and document success

» Environmental health is local!
Sharing Environmental Data

» Empowers public health and public health advocates

» Empowers communities

» Empowers consumers
App Tracks Restaurant Health Inspection Data State-by-State

It's called What the Health.

by Khushbu Shah | Jan 22, 2015, 1:32pm EST

Via App Puts Restaurant Health Reports at Your Fingertips [WWL], Yelp Joins Forces With Governments to Publish Restaurant Inspection Data [E], and All App Coverage
Juggling multiple roles and competing interests

» Protect the public

» Protect and improve population health AND provide health screening and treatment

» Protect individual privacy

» Implement regulatory programs

» Protect business reputation

» Protect business proprietary information

» Inform the public
1854 Soho Cholera Outbreak

Science *plus* law

John Snow’s study of water-borne cholera cases essential

...as *is*

Local council’s action to remove Broad Street Pump Handle
The star indicates the water pump closest to the most deaths (black bars). The circles are other water pumps. Note that the map only solved the problem because of unique locations.

Today: Could John Snow map be publicly disseminated?

Why or why not?

Area near a closed industrial site. 22 out of 40 private wells tested positive for Dioxin wells – Map shows specific sites – disseminate publicly?

Why or why not?

What does your agency do?
Are aggregate data “protected health information” (PHI)?

Legionnaires’ Disease in Genesee County
2019 Update

TOTAL CONFIRMED CASES: 14
Age:
- Range: 41-90 years
- Average: 62 years
- Median: 60 years

Legionnaires' Disease Cases by Month of Onset or Referral Date, Genesee County 2013-2019
Protected health information (PHI)

- Information, including demographic information:
  - In any form: written, electronic or oral
  - Relating to past, present or future
    - Physical or mental health status or condition
    - Provision of health care
    - Payment for provision of health care
- That identifies the individual or for which there is a reasonable basis to believe can be used to identify the individual
De-Identification – Safe Harbor

» HIPAA lists 18 identifiers that must be removed + very small risk that anticipated recipient could identify individual

» Geographical identifiers: Smaller than a State, except for the initial three digits of a zip code if, combined area contains more than 20,000 people

» Dates: All elements of dates (except year) for dates directly related to an individual, including birth date, admission date, discharge date, date of death; all ages over 89 may be aggregated into a single category of age 90 or older
De-Identification – Expert Determination

» Person with appropriate knowledge and experience
» Applies statistical or scientific principles
» Determines very small risk that anticipated recipient could identify individual
» May use mitigation strategies to reduce risk
» Documents methods and results of analysis
Legionella data: HIPAA does not apply.  

This law does . . .

Communicable Disease Rules,  R 325.181

» Medical and epidemiological information which identifies an individual and which is gathered in connection with an investigation is confidential and is not open to public inspection without the individual's consent or the consent of the individual's guardian, unless public inspection is necessary to protect the public health as determined by a local health officer or the state health director.
Using law to protect the public’s health

**CAN I?**

Legal question: Do I have authority?

**MUST I?**

Legal question: Does law leave me no choice?

**SHOULD I?**

Policy question: How should I exercise my discretion?
Navigating law
De-Identification

might be a key to open doors

» If remove or obscure personally identifying information in a dataset

» Then most laws do not prohibit release of de-identified information
De-Identification as a solution

“Data can be either useful or perfectly anonymous, but never both.”  Professor Paul Ohm

**Concern:** Data regarding small geographic size, specific populations, sparsely populated areas, identifying populations based on multiple characteristics or unique characteristics

**Concern:** Informing the public - Aggregate data can be identifiable

**Concern:** Sufficient identifiers needed to link and combine data across databases and data sources
Statistical de-identification techniques

- Anonymizing/de-identifying data
- Generalization
- Restrictions on geographic detail
- Recoding into intervals and rounding
- Cell suppression
- Subsampling
- See de-identification toolkit
Machines that read data

Digital Data
• Machine learning
• Decision support

Computer software
• De-identify data
• Merge identifiable data-sets without any person being able to view the data in identifiable form

Image Credit: CC BY 2.0 Jeff Golden
Overview of Legal & Policy Challenges
So many hazards...

- Drinking water contaminants – surface and groundwater sources
- Air pollution, indoor air (e.g., carbon monoxide)
- Food
- Hazardous waste
- Pesticides
- Heavy metals (e.g., mercury, lead)
- Radiation
- Bioterrorism
- Asbestos
- Chemical spills
- Housing quality issues
- Bioterrorism
- Agricultural waste (e.g., hog farms)

So many health outcomes (suspected or confirmed environmental etiology) …

» Respiratory/lung diseases (e.g., asthma, COPD, asbestosis)

» Neurological disorders (e.g., encephalitis, Parkinson’s, Alzheimer’s)

» Skin disorders

» Chronic liver disease and cirrhosis

» Heart diseases

» Blood diseases

» Birth defects (e.g., low birth weight, congenital anomalies)

» Developmental disabilities

» Reproductive disorders

» Kidney diseases

» Immune disorders

» Cancer (e.g., leukemia)

» Diabetes

CDC National Environmental Public Health Tracking Network: [https://ephtracking.cdc.gov/](https://ephtracking.cdc.gov/)

- Regulatory processes (e.g., inspections, permit applications, required reporting)
- Public health surveillance
  - Biomonitoring (e.g., blood lead levels, newborn screening blood spots)
  - Routine disease reporting (e.g., mandated communicable disease reporting, syndromic surveillance)
  - Disease/condition-specific registries (e.g., birth defects, cancer)
- **Surveys** (e.g., Nat’l Health & Nutrition Examination Survey (NHANES))
- Vital Statistics
- Electronic health records
- Research and tissue repositories

So many disconnected sources of data...
Food-poisoning tweets get city follow-up

Health authorities seek out sickened Chicagoans, ask them to report restaurants

August 13, 2013  By Monica Eng, Chicago Tribune reporter

When Juan Anguiano fired off a tweet about a bout of food poisoning in April, he thought he might hear back from sympathetic friends or pick up a new follower.

"I wasn't expecting the city of Chicago to tweet me and ask me to file a report," said Anguiano, an editor for Univision.
So many laws. . .

to obtaining, using, and disclosing EH data

Law governs every aspect of data

Collection  Use
Sharing    Protection

Law friend or foe?
- How does law help us to do our job?
- How is law a barrier?
How do you analyze a data sharing issue?

One bite at a time
Analyzing a data sharing issue

1. **Establish facts**
   -- What
   -- Who
   -- Why

2. **Identify law**

3. **Apply law**

4. **Establish & document terms for sharing**
The WHAT

» What do you want to address (what public health threat)?

» What do you want to accomplish?

» What is your level of focus?

- Individual (e.g. case management; care coordination; crisis intervention)
- Systems (e.g. assessment and improvement; of individual organization or human services or health services delivery systems)
- Population health (e.g. public health or community interventions)
The WHAT

» What do you want to address (what public health threat)?

  **Big picture**: Children in the community have been exposed to a hazard. Health and social services are needed to mitigate harm.

» What do you want to accomplish?

  **Specific goals**: Provide resources and linkages to care for children exposed to the hazard; translate learnings to prevent harm in other communities

» What is your level of focus?

  - **Focus is primarily on the individual**: Connect children to needed services and care.

Example: Hazard Exposure Registry

Data Summit 10 03 2019
The WHAT

What data do you need to accomplish your goal?

- Data Type
- Data Source
- Data Elements
Data needed from state health dept.:

- Medicaid claims data (potentially obtained through CMS or through state Medicaid program)
- State Disease Surveillance System
- Vital Records
- Birth Defects Registry
- Cancer Registry
- Immunization Registry
- Hazard-specific health department programs
- Women, Infants, and Children (WIC) program

Example: Hazard Exposure Registry
Analyzing a data sharing issue

1. Establish facts
   -- What
   -- Who
   -- Why

2. Identify law

3. Apply law

4. Establish & document terms for sharing
Informed consent as a solution. . . .

people just want to be asked

**Concern:** May not be easy to design or implement an informed consent process

**Concern:** reduce value of data

-- Self-selection

-- Justice – inclusion of under-represented and vulnerable groups

**Concern:** Need the population data for population health
Challenges in Sharing Meaningful Data

» PH data – state law mostly governs (varies)
» Each data type may be controlled by own law
» Legal interpretations necessary—when in doubt lawyers say “no”
» De-identification (HIPAA’s influence) & re-identification risk
  - No reasonable basis to believe that the information can be used to identify an individual
  - Lack of statistical expert
Courts Drawing Lines
Illinois Supreme Court


Illinois Public Health Dept. (IDPH) denied newspaper’s FOI request for Cancer Registry information regarding incidence of neuroblastoma, including type of cancer, date of diagnosis, and zip code. Court ordered IDPH to release data, despite expert testimony regarding risk of re-identification, because the general public would not be able to re-identify.
Courts Drawing Lines
Ohio Supreme Court


Health department must release lead risk assessment reports and lead-citation notices to newspaper under FOI, which contain specific household addresses. Were issued to property owners of residences with children with blood tests that indicated elevated lead levels.
Courts Drawing Lines
Ohio Supreme Court

» Cuyahoga Cnty Bd. of Health v. Lipson O’Shea Legal Group (2016)

Health department properly denied attorney’s FOI request for “documentation or information of all homes … where a minor child was found to have elevated blood lead levels in excess of 10 [mcg/dl].” House address was linked to a specific blood lead level and therefore “inextricably linked” to PHI.
Ohio Department of Health to publish homes that remain a lead hazard statewide

By Rachel Dissell, Brie Zeltner, The Plain Dealer

CLEVELAND, Ohio - The Ohio Department of Health (ODH) will soon make public the location of homes with unaddressed lead hazards as part of its stepped up oversight on investigations of childhood lead poisoning cases, officials said.

ODH plans to release a list of all non-compliant cases on its website when this process is complete, Amato said.

The Plain Dealer received the information, which is current through October 2016, from Advocates for Basic Legal Equity (ABLE) Inc., a which requested it from the state as part of its efforts to advocate for lead-safe living environments for children in the Toledo area.
# Ohio Lead Hazardous Properties

**Description:** Properties with Notices of Non-Compliance/Orders to Vacate for Lead Hazards  
**Category:** Prevention  
**Last Updated:** 9/27/2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>County</th>
<th>Zip</th>
<th>Local Lead Jurisdiction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Map It</td>
<td>176 Wendell Ave B</td>
<td>Peebles</td>
<td>Adams</td>
<td>45660-2201</td>
<td>Ohio Department of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map It</td>
<td>1207 N Main St</td>
<td>Delphos</td>
<td>Allen</td>
<td>45833-1147</td>
<td>Ohio Department of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map It</td>
<td>1002 N Jefferson St</td>
<td>Lima</td>
<td>Allen</td>
<td>45801-4169</td>
<td>Ohio Department of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map It</td>
<td>1131 1/2 W Wayne St</td>
<td>Lima</td>
<td>Allen</td>
<td>45805-2467</td>
<td>Ohio Department of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map It</td>
<td>234 S Collett St</td>
<td>Lima</td>
<td>Allen</td>
<td>45805-3204</td>
<td>Ohio Department of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map It</td>
<td>334 S Collett St</td>
<td>Lima</td>
<td>Allen</td>
<td>45805-3206</td>
<td>Ohio Department of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map It</td>
<td>433 Franklin St</td>
<td>Lima</td>
<td>Allen</td>
<td>45804-1509</td>
<td>Ohio Department of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map It</td>
<td>832 W Wayne St</td>
<td>Lima</td>
<td>Allen</td>
<td>45801-3933</td>
<td>Ohio Department of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map It</td>
<td>15 Ferrell Ave</td>
<td>Ashland</td>
<td>Ashland</td>
<td>44805-4024</td>
<td>Ohio Department of Health</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Harris County Lead Safe Housing Registry

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rental Occupied</th>
<th>Unit Address</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>Zip-Code</th>
<th>Lead Safe Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>3310 Carter</td>
<td>Pasadena</td>
<td>77503</td>
<td>August 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>322 E. Wright</td>
<td>Baytown</td>
<td>77520</td>
<td>March 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>3226 Nebraska</td>
<td>Baytown</td>
<td>77520</td>
<td>February 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>13702 Longview</td>
<td>Houston</td>
<td>77015</td>
<td>February 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>201 Bolster</td>
<td>Baytown</td>
<td>77520</td>
<td>January 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>1705 Maryland</td>
<td>Baytown</td>
<td>77520</td>
<td>December 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>300 W. Cleveland</td>
<td>Baytown</td>
<td>77520</td>
<td>December 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>1705 Michigan</td>
<td>Baytown</td>
<td>77520</td>
<td>December 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>500 E. Murrill</td>
<td>Baytown</td>
<td>77520</td>
<td>August 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>323 FM1942</td>
<td>Crosby</td>
<td>77532</td>
<td>August 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>10106 Chadwick</td>
<td>Jacinto City</td>
<td>77029</td>
<td>August 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>201 W. Nazro</td>
<td>Baytown</td>
<td>77520</td>
<td>July 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>409 W. Adue</td>
<td>Baytown</td>
<td>77520</td>
<td>May 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>401 W. Adue</td>
<td>Baytown</td>
<td>77520</td>
<td>May 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>1206 Azalea Ct.</td>
<td>Pasadena</td>
<td>77506</td>
<td>January 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental</td>
<td>2012 10th</td>
<td>Galena Park</td>
<td>77547</td>
<td>January 2017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Non-legal challenges to obtaining AND using EH data

» Data is often too OLD to be useful

» Data is often too GENERAL to be useful
  » May be available only at national or state level. Even when available at county level, may be still be too general; may need census tract, individual data to address threats.

» Lack of standardization across sources

» DELAY between exposure and onset of symptoms
  » Logistical challenges with linking data
  » Difficult to predict / calculate cumulative impact of prolonged, low-dose exposures
Policy challenges to obtaining and using EH data

» Lack of capacity / funding to conduct routine surveillance relating to hazards & exposure
  » Activities may be limited to legally mandated regulatory/enforcement functions, rather than proactive monitoring

» Environmental health data is often not prioritized... but how can we change that without data?

» Separation between environmental agencies and public health agencies → distinct purposes and cultures
"The removal of environmental health authority from public health agencies has led to fragmented responsibility, lack of coordination, and inadequate attention to the public health dimensions of environmental issues (Institute of Medicine, 1988a)."

Ethical challenges

to obtaining, using, and disclosing data

» Disclosing hazard data without health outcomes may nevertheless reveal identities of affect persons

» Potential for stigmatizing neighborhoods or communities

» Will this action create/perpetuate inequities?
Navigating Law to Share Data

Network for Public Health Law Resources

- Checklist of Factual Information Needed to Address Proposed Data Collection, Access and Sharing to Improve the Health of Communities
- Data De-Identification Toolkit
- Federal Privacy Laws – snapshots + annotated compilation
- HIPAA Hybrid Status Toolkit

https://www.networkforphl.org/resources/topics_resources/health_information_and_data_sharing/
Navigating Law to Share Data
Resources continued

http://legalbib.communitycommons.org/
Thank you!

Denise Chrysler, J.D.

dchrysler@networkforphl.org

Colleen Healy Boufides, J.D.

chealyboufides@networkforphl.org

Sangeeta Ghosh, J.D., LL.M.

sangeeta.ghosh@kentcountymi.gov

I love Lawyers

Data Summit 10 03 2019